



Advisers

Thank you

Thank you for trusting the Arkansas Scholastic Press Association with your publication. We know putting the hard work of your students up for judging can be nerve wracking; after all, you're putting their (and your) time, energy and, oftentimes, tears up for review. It takes bravery and we appreciate you.

The Results

First, and we can't emphasize this enough, do not evaluate the hard work you do with your kids every day solely with this critique. Everyday you shape lives, teach writing, technology, people skills and a host of other things that are far more important than any rating a critique could provide.

So what should you do with the results? Use them as a way to look for what to attack next. Take this judge's suggestions and figure out a handful of things you want to make better in your next book. Once your staff has mastered those things, pick out another handful. Use the critique as a teaching tool. Remember: It's a formative assessment and not a summative.

The Standards

Our standards are heavily influenced by the critique provided by the National Scholastic Press Association. In fact, they're nearly identical. Why? We wanted our state level critique and competitions to mirror the national critique and competitions.

We also need to give a nod to the Columbia Scholastic Press Association. They are the other major national critique service and we borrowed from their format.

Judges

Thank you

Thank you so much for taking the time to help advance scholastic journalism in Arkansas. We know you have many demands outside of this critique and appreciate you making the time for Arkansas.

Judging

We ask that you judge with education in mind. This critique should serve as a learning service much more than a ranking service. Please provide thorough explanations to justify your scores. More importantly, provide examples of where they're doing it right and where they're doing it wrong. As you know, checks without meaningful written comments and specific examples aren't very helpful.

Scoring

The numerical score you give each book does not have to have an exact correlation to the check mark ratings. We recognize not all criteria rank equally. However, please make an effort to have your numerical score fall in the ball park of your check mark ratings.

Again, we appreciate your time! Thank you.



Arkansas
SCHOLASTIC PRESS
ASSOCIATION

	Exceeds Standard+	Meets Standard ✓	Needs Attention -
<p>Literary Magazine Standards (Adapted from the National Scholastic Press Association critique sheet)</p>			
Literary Magazine: Essentials			
A unique theme is developed verbally and visually and ties the book together.			
The cover has visual appeal and introduces the unifying devices.			
The name and year of the magazine appear on the front cover.			
The magazine name, year, volume number, school name, city and state appear on the spine or early pages of the magazine.			
The theme is developed through thematic elements (words, photos and graphics) where appropriate in the magazine.			
The theme is developed through thematic elements (words, photos and graphics) on the cover, title page, opening pages, dividers, closing pages, including the last page in the book, with details supporting the overall artistic integrity of the magazine.			
Opening, closing, divider pages and any special section pages have a thematic design style distinctively different from the rest of the book.			
The title page lists the name of the book, year, volume number, school, city, district, street address, state, zip code, and theme reference.			
The table of contents accurately lists all major sections, including related art work. Contents is reader friendly and reflects thematic elements from the cover. The contents listing should not be on the title page but should appear early in the book before the first division page.			
Folios identify page content and give page numbers. At least one folio per spread appears as a reader reference.			
The colophon appears in the magazine in front matter or at the end of the book and includes staff credits, fonts used, staff size, equipment used, price of book to the students (if applicable), dates of coverage, where the book was printed and by what company.			
Acknowledgments, dedications and memorials are presented consistently in an understated manner. Tribute coverage should be part of the staff's publication policy.			
The overall organization of the magazine is logical and highlights the student work therein.			
The magazine reflects students in the school, both writers and audience, in a variety of ways.			



Arkansas
SCHOLASTIC PRESS
ASSOCIATION

Literary Magazine: Essentials Continued
Judge's Comments

Discuss positives while referencing specific examples and specific pages.	Discuss areas needing attention while referencing specific examples and specific pages.

Essentials Score _____ /100	<input type="checkbox"/> Special Recognition (Describe rationale in a few words)
---------------------------------------	---

	+	✓	-
Literary Magazine: Content and Quality			
The magazine includes variety, originality and diversity of ideas and themes.			
Works contained in the magazine display effective use of language, expression and clarity.			
Content reflects a variety of genres (drama, comedy, fantasy) that clearly supports writers' voices and themes.			
Chosen works demonstrate various literary forms (poetry, prose, play, narrative, non fiction) and images arranged in a clear and connected way.			
The magazine demonstrates masterful use of literary devices including but not limited to metaphor, personification, symbols, irony and imagery.			
Visual content reflects the same care in selection and presentation as written content to enhance writing but provide strong narrative voice on its own and with selected writings.			
Variety extends to types of artwork (photography, mixed media, painting and digital).			
Controversial or sensitive topics reflect care of the student writer and target audience of the school and are developed thoroughly.			



Arkansas
SCHOLASTIC PRESS
ASSOCIATION

Literary Magazine: Content and Quality Judge's Comments	
Discuss positives while referencing specific examples and specific pages.	Discuss areas needing attention while referencing specific examples and specific pages.

Content Score	<div style="display: flex; align-items: center;"> <div style="flex-grow: 1; border-bottom: 1px solid black; margin-right: 5px;"></div> /100 </div>	<input type="checkbox"/> Special Recognition (Describe rationale in a few words)
---------------	---	---

	+	✓	-
Literary Magazine: Writing			
The magazine includes poetry in a variety of forms that demonstrates strong skills using literary devices in creative and innovative ways to enhance emotional impact across a multitude of relevant themes.			
Nonfiction writing from across the curriculum represents diverse student perspectives and opinions to interest an educated audience.			
Narrative fiction tells compelling stories that feature round and diverse characters, original plot lines and strong imagery that appeals to a wide target audience.			
Student work includes original, conflict-driven drama (play or screen writing) that follows defined formats with expressive dialogue, developed characters and detailed plotting.			
The writing demonstrates masterful use of literary devices including but not limited to metaphor, personification, symbols, irony and imagery.			



Arkansas
SCHOLASTIC PRESS
ASSOCIATION

	+	✓	-
Literary Magazine: Writing Continued			
Personal essays engage strong student voices, detail personal experiences and consider target student audiences.			
Theme elements written by the literary magazine staff support and reflect on student work.			
The magazine incorporates unique pieces such as song lyrics, language translations or other experimental types of writing. Links to multimedia works are considered but not required.			
All forms of writing are carefully edited and proofed to eliminate mechanical errors such as spelling, grammar, sentence structure, usage, syntax and agreement in keeping with the intended writing structure of the pieces.			
Exceptions to standard forms of punctuation or editing are purposeful to support a writer's message or poetic form.			
Individual bylines recognize student writers for their work.			

Literary Magazine: Writing Judge's Comments				
Discuss positives while referencing specific examples and specific pages.	Discuss areas needing attention while referencing specific examples and specific pages.			

Writing Score	_____ / 100	<input type="checkbox"/> Special Recognition (Describe rationale in a few words)
----------------------	-------------	---



Arkansas
SCHOLASTIC PRESS
ASSOCIATION

	+	✓	-
Literary Magazine: Design			
Design decisions have been made to enhance the writing and artwork in the magazine and make it easy for the reader to navigate the pages.			
Typically, layouts are designed as two-page spreads.			
Layouts vary based on the type and style of writing but maintain overall cohesion within the magazine and theme.			
Typography is legible and well-planned. Font choice, weight and size enhances the content of the spread and is easy to read.			
Design principles such as contrast, repetition, alignment and proximity provide unifying elements for the magazine design.			
Use of white or negative space works as a reader service on three levels — tight (to unify), standard (for consistency) and expanded (to separate).			
Color is used to highlight the content of the spread and is not so overpowering that it draws attention to itself.			
Font choices should be limited to two or three throughout the magazine with a possibility of using a dedicated theme font.			
Graphic elements — lines, screens, reverses and spot color — enhance content rather than calling attention to themselves. Distracting gimmicks are avoided.			
Graphic elements are repeated within a section or throughout the magazine to achieve unity rather than to decorate and fill space.			
Body copy, titles and bylines are consistent in type style and size throughout the magazine to enhance unity. Exceptions may be made on theme-related or special pages.			
Artwork and writing displayed on the same page or overlaying do not distract from each other or decrease the viewing experience for the art piece or readability of the writing.			
Typographic elements such as initial letters, lead-ins, quote blurbs and display type, when used consistently, enhance readability by leading readers into copy without distractions or unnecessary repetition.			
Added elements such as running headers or page folios are designed in a way to enhance the core content of the magazine. Bleeds, margins and other settings are consistent.			
Consideration in the design is given to art work to allow for clear viewing and to enhance understanding of the pieces.			
The size, orientation, print and binding options of the magazine reflect careful planning on the part of the designers to present written and artistic work in the best possible framework. Decisions made purely for budgetary reasons or errors made by printers will not be penalized.			
Individual design credits recognize student designers for their work.			



Arkansas
SCHOLASTIC PRESS
ASSOCIATION

Literary Magazine: Design
Judge's Comments

Discuss positives while referencing specific examples and specific pages.	Discuss areas needing attention while referencing specific examples and specific pages.

Design Score	<input type="checkbox"/> Special Recognition (Describe rationale in a few words)
_____ /100	

	+	✓	-
Literary Magazine: Photography and Art			
The magazine incorporates a variety of student art work (photography, mixed media, painting, digital art) that both expresses individual artists and supports its overall theme and purpose.			
Art work is rendered with high-quality photography, maintaining the original color values, hues, and contrast of the art.			
Photos use basic techniques (framing, repetition, leading lines, depth-of-field, unusual angles and rule of thirds) to capture the intent.			
Cropping emphasizes the center of interest, eliminates unnecessary areas, people and distractions.			
Cropping avoids chopping off subjects unnecessarily, cropping at a joint or forcing an image into an awkward space to fit the layout.			
The center of interest in each photo is in focus.			
Photos have proper contrast.			
Color photos have accurate color values.			



Arkansas
SCHOLASTIC PRESS
ASSOCIATION

	+	✓	-
Literary Magazine: Photography and Art Continued			
Images should be free of distortion and not stretched. Art work should be placed with original dimensions in mind.			
Images are not pixelated and have minimal digital noise (appearance of grain).			
Any black and white images should have a wide range of tones—black, white and shades of gray.			
No copyrighted images are used without written permission from the original creator.			
Images and art work tell stories and provide emotional impact separately and in support of related or nearby writing. Groupings of images support the magazine’s theme.			
If bleeds are used, they are consistently applied to frame the art work without detracting from it or cutting off elements.			
Art work expresses a range of ideas and themes; effort to connect the art and photography to the magazine theme and to writing can be clearly seen.			
Art work demonstrates clear understanding and skills with artistic elements such as color, shape, contrast, perspective and lines.			
Individual photo and artwork credits recognize student artists for their work.			

Literary Magazine: Photography and Art	
Judge’s Comments	
Discuss positives while referencing specific examples and specific pages.	Discuss areas needing attention while referencing specific examples and specific pages.

Photo/Art Score _____ / 100	<input type="checkbox"/> Special Recognition (Describe rationale in a few words)
---------------------------------------	---

Total Score
_____/500

Rating
 375-500 Superior
 330-374 Excellent
 250-329 Honorable
Mention



Arkansas
SCHOLASTIC PRESS
ASSOCIATION

Publication Name

School Name

Score Breakdown

Overall Comments

Essentials Score
_____/100
 Special Recognition

Content Score
_____/100
 Special Recognition

Writing Score
_____/100
 Special Recognition

Design Score
_____/100
 Special Recognition

Photo/Art Score
_____/100
 Special Recognition

Judges: Please provide final thoughts on the overall book. It's a final opportunity to offer praise, encouragement and constructive criticism.